

Mongolia - Property Rights - Land Registration System

Report generated on: March 29, 2018

Visit our data catalog at: <https://data.mcc.gov/evaluations/index.php>

Overview

Identification

COUNTRY

Mongolia

EVALUATION TITLE

Property Rights - Land Registration System

EVALUATION TYPE

Independent Impact Evaluation

ID NUMBER

DDI-MCC-MNG-IPA-CB-RSPS-2018-v1

Version

VERSION DESCRIPTION

Anonymized dataset for public distribution

Overview

ABSTRACT

IPA:

Evaluation design: Impact Evaluation

1. Pre-post comparison of time and cost involving in select land-based transactions
2. Involve two main instruments of measurement: Back Office time tracking survey and the Banking survey
3. Qualitative interviews were conducted with registry officers to inform the understanding of how these measures affected workflow

Evaluation question:

Did some of the institutional strengthening activities of PRP reduce time and cost of completing land-based transactions?

The institutional strengthening activities that can be evaluated are the installation of web-based electronic registry system (ePRS), the revision to law that govern access to property records law, and the digitization of paper archives.

Results:

Back Office Time Tracking survey - Tracked 9 land based transactions at General Authority of State Registry (GASR) - Shortest process, registering a collateral agreement took 6 work days. Longest process, registering land or structure on land took 12 days. Transactions took 3-6 days longer than official time posted by GASR.

Banking survey - Tracked time it takes to apply for a mortgage or land-based loan including time it takes to prepare document, to submit and wait for bank approval, and to visit GASR offices to register for the mortgage or loan. Mortgage - 25 days for loan process and 14 days to prepare paperwork for loan application, total cost 360 USD. For land based loan - took 13 days for the loan process and 7.5 days to prepare paperwork, total cost 130 USD.

Informational interviews - Mixed responses. All officers agree that there has been changes to the registration flow. However, lack of consensus on whether the changes have shortened the weight time for citizens. While opening of district offices have shortened travel distance for some citizens, multiple locations meant that documents had to travel to the main office for official signatures. All officers agreed that workload increased yet workforce did not. There was consensus that more people are registering due to increased awareness and growing construction sector. Officers also noted that government mandated 8% mortgage has increased demand for mortgages. Officers agree that technical upgrades provided by PRP have improved

efficiency and that outreach activity had educated the public regarding property rights.

CLOUDBURST GROUP:

Evaluation design: Performance Evaluation

This is a follow-up endline evaluation that adapts an existing evaluation design developed by IPA. Five research questions drive this follow-up evaluation:

- 1) Did the land registry system strengthening component of the PRP lead to increases in demand and volume of formal land transactions, including land registration and related transfers at GAIPSR and mortgages at the banks?
- 2) What were the characteristics of those who conducted formal land transactions before and after the introduction of ePRS?
- 3) Did the land registry system strengthening component of the PRP result in changes in land transaction costs/time for land transactions?
- 4) Were there changes in gender ratio of land owners? Were there any differences in results for parcels held by women/men?
- 5) Did the land registry system strengthening component of the PRP lead to improvement in quality of property registration services? What was the significance of the land registry system strengthening component of the PRP?

This follow-up evaluation draws upon six main sources of primary and secondary data to answer the evaluation questions: ePRS land transaction data, pre-ePRS land transaction data, a banking customer survey, structured key informant interviews (KIIs) with GAIPSR registrars and bank loan officers, focus group discussions (FGDs) with key beneficiary groups, and open-ended KIIs with key project stakeholders. In addition, the evaluation will produce a final ERR calculation of this activity of the PRP based on the main expected benefit streams.

The PRP took place from 2008 to 2013, so this follow-up endline evaluation is occurring approximately five years after the close of project activities.

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

Pre-Post

UNITS OF ANALYSIS

Banking - Individuals applying for a mortgage or loan using property as collateral at banks

Back office - application to process property-related transaction at GASR

KIND OF DATA

Sample survey data [ssd]

TOPICS

Topic	Vocabulary	URI
Land	MCC Sector	

Coverage

GEOGRAPHIC COVERAGE

IPA:

Institutional Strengthening component of Property Rights Project was national wide in scope. While the physical upgrades to General Authority on State Registry (GASR) occurred in select project areas and electronic property rights system was first installed in project areas, legislative changes will be nationwide and adoption of ePRS is expected to roll out to rest of the country.

CLOUDBURST GROUP:

Different PRP components had different levels of geographic coverage across Ulaanbaatar and the rest of Mongolia.

The infrastructure support provided to ALAMGaC was intended to improve cadastral mapping capabilities nationally. Additionally, the recommended legislative changes will have nationwide impacts if/when legislation is passed.

Physical improvements were made to the under-resourced Property Rights Registration Department's (which eventually merged into GAIPSR, at the time called GASR) Central Office space, and new offices were established in four districts of Ulaanbaatar (Baganuur, Bayanzurkh, Chingeltei, and Songinokhairkhan). The document digitization and electronic registry upgrades were implemented in the Capital City of Ulaanbaatar and in eight provinces around the country [City of Erdenet (Orkhon aimag); City of Darkhan (Darkhan-Uul aimag); City of Arvaikheer (Uvurkhangai aimag); City of Uliastai (Zavkhan aimag); City of Khovd (Khovd aimag); of Zuunmod (Tuv aimag); City of Undurkhaan (Khentii aimag); and City of Choibalsan (Dornod aimag)]. These locations were chosen to produce maximum benefits as these provincial centers comprise Mongolia's main populated areas. However, this work (digitization and ePRS adoption) is expected to rollout nationwide with additional donor support.

UNIVERSE

The Banking survey covered Loan Applicants at banks, men and women aged above 18.

The Back office time tracking survey covered people who engaged in land-based transactions at General Authority of State Registry (GASR).

The informational interview covered qualitative interviews with GASR workers - Registry Officers of three district GASR offices (Chingeltei, Bayanzurkh, and Songinokhairkhan).

Producers and Sponsors

PRIMARY INVESTIGATOR(S)

Name	Affiliation
Innovations for Poverty Action	
The Cloudburst Group	

FUNDING

Name	Abbreviation	Role
Millennium Challenge Corporation	MCC	

Metadata Production

METADATA PRODUCED BY

Name	Abbreviation	Affiliation	Role
Innovations for Poverty Action	IPA		Independent Evaluator
The Cloudburst Group	CB		Independent Evaluator

DATE OF METADATA PRODUCTION

2018-03-26

DDI DOCUMENT VERSION

Version 1.0 (December 2014): This is the first version.

DDI DOCUMENT ID

DDI-MCC-MNG-IPA-CB-RSPS-2018-v1

MCC Compact and Program

COMPACT OR THRESHOLD

Mongolia Compact

PROGRAM

Registry System Process Survey evaluates select subactivities of one of the components of Property Rights Project. PRP carried out following set of activities under the two project areas: 1. Improving the formal system of land privatization and registration: a. Establish a commission of stakeholders and technical experts to: 1) identify obstacles to Mongolian citizens' ability to privatize and register land efficiently and cost effectively; 2) make recommendations on how to reduce such obstacles; and 3) work with government agencies to implement these recommendations. b. Upgrade the geospatial infrastructure used by Mongolian government agencies, including the provision of Continually Operating Reference Stations (CORS) and Global Positioning System (GPS) equipment to regional land offices, and training on the use of each. Create a centralized electronic registration system that is accessible from any registration office in Mongolia. c. Improve the capacity building for land offices, including the creation of Land Market Specialist (LMS) positions to help citizens resolve issues related to land privatization and the training of land office staff in land law and the use of satellite imagery. d. Upgrade the physical infrastructure of state registry offices, including improvements to the State Registry's Central Office space, the establishment of new offices in four districts of Ulaanbaatar, (Songinokhairkhan; Bayanzurkh; Chingeltei; and Baghanuur), and upgrades for state registry offices in eight regional centers around the country [City of Erdenet (Orkhon aimag); City of Darkhan (Darkhan-Uul aimag); City of Arvaikheer (Uvurkhangai aimag); City of Uliastai (Zavkhan aimag); City of Khovd (Khovd aimag); City of Zuunmod (Tuv aimag); City of Undurkhaan (Khentii aimag); and City of Choibalsan (Dornod aimag)]. 2. Privatizing and registering land plots in ger areas: a. Provide active assistance to low and middle income households in completing the steps to privatize and register rights for land plots. b. Identify utility corridors and map public land areas within ger district areas. RSPS evaluates select activities under component 1.a and 1.b. Specifically, RSPS evaluates implementation of amended legislation that came as outcome of review of inadequacies of the current laws covering property rights records (1.a), the migration to centralized electronic property record system called ePRS and the digitization of paper based records that accompanied the migration to electronic record keeping system (1.b).

MCC SECTOR

Land (Land)

PROGRAM LOGIC

Registry System Process Survey evaluates select subactivities of one of the components of Property Rights Project. PRP carried out following set of activities under the two project areas: 1. Improving the formal system of land privatization and registration: a. Establish a commission of stakeholders and technical experts to: 1) identify obstacles to Mongolian citizens' ability to privatize and register land efficiently and cost effectively; 2) make recommendations on how to reduce such obstacles; and 3) work with government agencies to implement these recommendations. b. Upgrade the geospatial infrastructure used by Mongolian government agencies, including the provision of Continually Operating Reference Stations (CORS) and Global Positioning System (GPS) equipment to regional land offices, and training on the use of each. Create a centralized electronic registration system that is accessible from any registration office in Mongolia. c. Improve the capacity building for land offices, including the creation of Land Market Specialist (LMS) positions to help citizens resolve issues related to land privatization and the training of land office staff in land law and the use of satellite imagery. d. Upgrade the physical infrastructure of state registry offices, including improvements to the State Registry's Central Office space, the establishment of new offices in four districts of Ulaanbaatar, (Songinokhairkhan; Bayanzurkh; Chingeltei; and Baghanuur), and upgrades for state registry offices in eight regional centers around the country [City of Erdenet (Orkhon aimag); City of Darkhan (Darkhan-Uul aimag); City of Arvaikheer (Uvurkhangai aimag); City of Uliastai (Zavkhan aimag); City of Khovd (Khovd aimag); City of Zuunmod (Tuv aimag); City of Undurkhaan (Khentii aimag); and City of Choibalsan (Dornod aimag)]. 2. Privatizing and registering land plots in ger areas: a. Provide active assistance to low and middle income households in completing the steps to privatize and register rights for land plots. b. Identify utility corridors and map public land areas within ger district areas. RSPS evaluates select activities under component 1.a and 1.b. Specifically, RSPS evaluates implementation of amended legislation that came as outcome of review of inadequacies of the current laws covering property rights records (1.a), the migration to centralized electronic property record system called ePRS and the digitization of paper based records that accompanied the migration to electronic record keeping system (1.b).

PROGRAM PARTICIPANTS

The Banking survey covered Loan Applicants at banks, men and women aged above 18. The Back office time tracking survey covered people who engaged in land-based transactions at General Authority of State Registry (GASR). The informational interview covered qualitative interviews with GASR workers - Registry Officers of three district GASR offices (Chingeltei, Bayanzurkh, and Songinokhairkhan).

Sampling

Study Population

The Banking survey covered Loan Applicants at banks, men and women aged above 18. The Back office time tracking survey covered people who engaged in land-based transactions at General Authority of State Registry (GASR). The informational interview covered qualitative interviews with GASR workers - Registry Officers of three district GASR offices (Chingeltei, Bayanzurkh, and Songinokhairkhan).

Questionnaires

Overview

IPA:

All questionnaires are available both in English and Mongolian, although administered in Mongolian.

- Banking survey - There were 3 questionnaires for the Banking Survey:

1. Potential
2. Initial
3. Follow-Up.

The Potential survey was used to identify potential respondents during the early stages of the loan application process. If passed, then the enumerator would immediately administer the initial survey which collected information about the early stages of the respondents' loan process and time costs of GASR related activities. Those that completed these two surveys were provided 7,000 MNT as a promised incentive for participating in the study. After approx. two weeks, the enumerators would follow up with the respondent using the Follow-Up survey which was administered over the phone.

- Back office time tracking survey - There was no questionnaire for this survey. The procedural times were tracked by attaching barcodes to documents associated with the key transactions and scanning the barcodes at specific stages to track the paperwork's progress through GASR offices.

- Informational Interview - The questionnaire consisted of three main parts.

1. Basic information and GASR Employment history
2. General perceptions of changes to GASR procedures and registration activity
3. Awareness and perceptions of specific PRP activities

CLOUDBURST GROUP:

The banking customer survey questionnaire will serve as the main source of information about changes over time in the average time and cost to obtain a loan and the types of loans obtained between the 1st and 2nd round banking customer surveys. The banking customer survey is designed to track eligible loan applications (land or property based transactions, such as mortgages or collateralized loans) from submission to approval, including the processing of document requests to GAIPSR, to provide a picture of how the improvements within GAIPSR (ePRS, document digitization) translate into time savings when accessing credit.

The GAIPSR structured KII questionnaire will be administered to all GAIPSR registrars employed at each district and province office within the MCA project area (Ulaanbaatar, Erdenet, Darkhan, Arvaikheer, Uliastai, Khovd, Zuuunmod, Undurkhaan and Choibalsan) to understand the effects of the PRP infrastructure and capacity building interventions, including ePRS, as comprehensively as possible. The approximate sample size is estimated based upon the fact that the GAIPSR offices visited during follow-up evaluation scoping had seven to nine registrars employed per location.

Another loan officer structured KII questionnaire will be administered to loan officers in Ulaanbaatar, Erdenet, Darkhan to understand the effects of registry strengthening on the lending process and general trends in the lending environment.

FGDs with subgroups of interest are proposed in each of the four districts covered by the decentralization activities in Ulaanbaatar: with women, with residents engaging in land transactions (both men and women), with ger area residents (both men and women), with loan officers (both men and women), and with real estate agents (both men and women).

The open-ended KII with key PRP stakeholders will provide additional nuanced context information about PRP implementation and changes since the end of the project.

Data Collection

Data Collection Dates

Start	End	Cycle
2013-09-16	2013-10-20	Banking Baseline
2013-07-15	2013-08-12	Back Office Baseline
2013-07-20	2013-07-26	Informational Interviews
2018-05-15	2018-12-31	Follow-up data collection

Questionnaires

IPA:

All questionnaires are available both in English and Mongolian, although administered in Mongolian.

- Banking survey - There were 3 questionnaires for the Banking Survey:

1. Potential
2. Initial
3. Follow-Up.

The Potential survey was used to identify potential respondents during the early stages of the loan application process. If passed, then the enumerator would immediately administer the initial survey which collected information about the early stages of the respondents' loan process and time costs of GASR related activities. Those that completed these two surveys were provided 7,000 MNT as a promised incentive for participating in the study. After approx. two weeks, the enumerators would follow up with the respondent using the Follow-Up survey which was administered over the phone.

- Back office time tracking survey - There was no questionnaire for this survey. The procedural times were tracked by attaching barcodes to documents associated with the key transactions and scanning the barcodes at specific stages to track the paperwork's progress through GASR offices.

- Informational Interview - The questionnaire consisted of three main parts.

1. Basic information and GASR Employment history
2. General perceptions of changes to GASR procedures and registration activity
3. Awareness and perceptions of specific PRP activities

CLOUDBURST GROUP:

The banking customer survey questionnaire will serve as the main source of information about changes over time in the average time and cost to obtain a loan and the types of loans obtained between the 1st and 2nd round banking customer surveys. The banking customer survey is designed to track eligible loan applications (land or property based transactions, such as mortgages or collateralized loans) from submission to approval, including the processing of document requests to GAIPSR, to provide a picture of how the improvements within GAIPSR (ePRS, document digitization) translate into time savings when accessing credit.

The GAIPSR structured KII questionnaire will be administered to all GAIPSR registrars employed at each district and province office within the MCA project area (Ulaanbaatar, Erdenet, Darkhan, Arvaikheer, Uliastai, Khovd, Zuunmod, Undurkhaan and Choibalsan) to understand the effects of the PRP infrastructure and capacity building interventions, including ePRS, as comprehensively as possible. The approximate sample size is estimated based upon the fact that the GAIPSR offices visited during follow-up evaluation scoping had seven to nine registrars employed per location.

Another loan officer structured KII questionnaire will be administered to loan officers in Ulaanbaatar, Erdenet, Darkhan to understand the effects of registry strengthening on the lending process and general trends in the lending environment.

FGDs with subgroups of interest are proposed in each of the four districts covered by the decentralization activities in Ulaanbaatar: with women, with residents engaging in land transactions (both men and women), with ger area residents (both men and women), with loan officers (both men and women), and with real estate agents (both men and women).

The open-ended KII with key PRP stakeholders will provide additional nuanced context information about PRP implementation and changes since the end of the project.

Data Collectors

Name	Abbreviation	Affiliation
MEC LLC		

Supervision

Banking Survey - Data collection by MEC LLC - team comprised of Survey Field Manager, 2 Staged Banking survey team (initial and follow up). The role of the enumerators include pilot testing of the survey instruments, and conducting the interview among potential and main respondents.

Back Office Time Tracking Survey - Data collection by MEC LLC - team comprised of Project team leader, Expert on Registration of Transactions at GASR, Database Manager, and Field Survey teams. Tasks of the field team leader include familiarization with general and 8 transaction workflow diagrams, attach the barcodes to each application until it reaches the target number, attach the barcodes at required steps, scan the barcode information at required steps, print the information using barcode printer, transfer the data using WiFi and server. The heads were responsible for smooth implementation of the data collection at each GASR office by ensuring that all application and the required steps are controlled, all equipment are working properly and information transferred smoothly.

Informational Interviews - Data was collected by two IPA staff and one Millennium Challenge Account PRP staff. These three interviewers interviewed a total of nine registry officers, three each. They were responsible for retrieving as much information possible in accordance with the questionnaire.

Data Processing

No content available

Data Appraisal

No content available